Ho Jun Kang

ESL 220-2

Leah Keys Stahl

Feedback for Zhihong Qian

June 14, 2011

Feedback for Zhihong Qian

1. **What kind of essay has your partner written—informative, expository, or argumentative? Has he/she chosen the best approach or would another approach be better? Why or why not?**

It is an expository essay which indicated by the thesis appeared in the first paragraph. He analyzed the negative impression of military duty, and explaining why he thinks it good to join military duty with his experience.

1. **Does the writer avoid the standard (and boring) 5‐paragraph essay structure? Or does the essay resemble the 5‐paragraph format too closely? In other words, has the writer attempted to write the essay in a more original, creative, and/or non‐standard way? If not, suggest how the write could approach the essay differently by changing its structure, presentation of thesis, level of creativity or originality, etc. AND explain why its present approach doesn’t work well.**

No there are thesis in the first paragraph, then explanation and specific detail and conclusion. It is a well organized 5 paragraph essay. For me, I will try putting others behavior and idea at first and second paragraph, then your idea about it and explain your idea with detail. In the end comes the thesis.

**INTRODCTION**

1. **Does the introduction grab your attention and interest? Does it effectively focus the reader’s attention on the topic and focus (purpose/thesis) of the essay? (Remember, the thesis doesn’t have to be stated right away but the writer should at least suggest the essay’s direction somehow.) In other words, does the logically introduce the topic and purpose of the essay and inspire some curiosity or interest in readers? Why or why not?**

Yes. I don’t know how Korea military duty works and want to learn it in his article, so it attracts me. The introduction is good and showed directly the thesis. I think it is better to expend how “Some of them even evade their military services”, to make it more interesting

**THESIS**

1. **What is the thesis? Is the thesis arguable? In other words, could you disagree with it, argue against it? Could the writer improve his/her thesis to make it more arguable? How? Evaluate the thesis and comment on why it does or doesn’t work.**

It appeared in the first paragraph that Although the army life is dangerous and difficult, joining the army helps your life. It is arguable that I can say because it is and dangerous difficult, it is not good for you. Clear thesis that states what he is talking about in the later paragraph.

1. **Do you feel that the writer’s purpose (thesis) is either too broad or too narrow? Would the essay be better if the writer expanded his/her idea a bit more or narrowed it down to something a bit more specific? Does it try to cover too much or too little? Why or why not?**

I think that the thesis statement is broad. He doesn’t indicate in which aspect the duty benefit him. I think its better to narrow it like “it teaches me never give up toward life”, because this idea is showed in his experience.

1. **Does the thesis clearly answer the questions “so what?” and “who cares?” for the reader? In other words, has the writer given the reader something new, interesting, unique, original, and/or surprising to consider? Does thesis do more than simply present an observation or fact? Does it instead point out something others wouldn’t normally notice or think about? Does it offer the reader a new perspective of some kind? In other words, does the writer say something meaningful about the topic that demonstrates critical thinking—something that readers likely have not considered or thought about?**

No. the thesis is not specific, when I look at his thesis I have no idea what is he going to talk about. And this idea is very common for all of us. Its better to narrow it down by providing specific aspect of how it is good for us.

1. **What kind of thesis does the writer use—implicit or explicit? What kind of reasoning does he/she use—inductive or deductive? Where is the thesis placed in the essay—beginning, middle, end? Evaluate each of these features of the thesis (purpose) and explain whether you think the writer has made good, effective choices about communicating his/her thesis.**

It is implicit because when I read it I don’t know how the military duty helps our life. It is placed in the beginning of the essay.

**BODY**

1. **Does each body paragraph develop the thesis a little bit more? Does each body paragraph add meaning to the thesis? In other words, are the all body paragraphs logically connected to and clearly relate to the thesis? Do any of them go off topic or include irrelevant, unnecessary information? Which ones? Why do you think so?**

Yes. The second paragraph are talking about why people hate military duty which is related to the first sentence of thesis. And in 3rd and 4th paragraph he provides his experience to explain how it helps his life. Body paragraphs and thesis are well connected.

1. **Does each body paragraph have a clear topic sentence OR main idea? In other words, does each paragraph FOCUS on a single point that supports/helps explain the thesis? Or are there paragraphs with multiple or disconnected ideas? Which ones?**

Yes it does. In the first sentence of second paragraph and the last sentence of 4th paragraph I can see the main idea. It is good.

1. **Has the writer balanced generalizations and specific detail well? Are there too many general ideas that make you, the reader, think “what does he/she mean?” Are there any places where you think there is way too much detail, which makes you, the reader, lose focus and wonder why the writer has included this information? Basically, do all the details clearly relate to the topic and thesis OR is there anything that just doesn’t “fit” or make senses(is irrelevant or unnecessary) that the writer could delete?**

No. too much detail about his personal experience are there when he explain how military duty benefit him. There seems to be a little generalizations which makes it unconvincing. Maybe he can explain more after telling his experience.

1. **Has the writer explained all of his/her ideas thoroughly and completely? Is all of the content clear and convincing? Or are you, as a reader, left with any unanswered questions? Does anything need to be explained more or explained better? What? Why?**

Yes. They are all clear and well organized, like I mentioned above. I think he can develop how his experience affects his later life.

**12. Which rhetorical strategies has the writer used most? Are these rhetorical strategies the most appropriate ones for the topic and thesis? (Remember, these are: Illustration, Narration, Description, Classification, Compare/Contrast, Definition, Process, Cause/Effect, and Refutation.) Is there anywhere where a different strategy would improve the paper? Where? Why?**

Narration is used most in his 4th paragraph to express how military affects his life. And compare/contrast is used in the introduction to contrast his idea with others’. And refutation is also appeared in the thesis.

1. **Is the essay well organized? Are the body paragraphs arranged in an order that makes sense—does each point follow the previous one in a logical way? Why or why not? How could the writer arrange sentences or paragraphs better?**

His essay is well- organized. Because each paragraph has a clear sentence shows main idea, which is related to the thesis.

**AUDIENCE & TONE**

1. **How would you describe the writer’s tone? Is it serious, playful, concerned, etc.? Is it too formal or informal? Is the writer’s tone appropriate for the subject (topic), thesis (purpose), and audience (readers)? Consider things like whether the writer has balanced his/her use of diction appropriately (general vs. specific, concrete vs. abstract, mono vs. multi syllable words, figurative language) and if he/she has tried to use vivid, interesting, SPECIFIC nouns, verbs, adjectives, adverbs. Explain your evaluation**

His tone is serious and informal. It is appropriate because military is a serious affair and it affect his life significantly. He use advanced word in his specific examples as a soldier, like “depart, eager to”.

1. **Does the writer consider his/her readers thoughtfully, being careful not to say anything to unnecessarily offend, anger, or show disrespect to readers? Explain your answer.**

Yes. The fact showed in the introduction about Korea army give foreign readers much information why people hate military duty in his country. But he used first, second, and third person view in one sentence in the first paragraph and the beginning of second paragraph, which makes his idea somehow unclear.

**CONCLUSION**

1. **Does the conclusion effectively bring the paper to a close, making it feel “finished”? Is it logical and make sense? Does it avoid introducing new ideas (it should avoid this)? Does it restate the thesis clearly in words that are different from the thesis?**

Yes, it makes sense. It restates the thesis clearly in different way. In the conclusion he says “By spending my time, 2 years, on army, I got invaluable things: a lot of sense of confidence, responsibility, and nationalism.” And the thesis is “Although the army life is dangerous and difficult, joining the army helps your life”.

1. **Does it offer a closing thought, giving readers something to keep thinking about? (For example, a warning, prediction for the future, suggestion, instructions, question to think about, call the readers to action, etc.)? (It should.)**

Yes, the final thought is “Although you can get various things which help in your life from the experience in the military service, do you still want to avoid this duty?” it makes me think about my opinion towards military duty.

**OVERALL EVALUATION**

1. **Do you feel like you have learned something by reading this essay? Has the writer worked hard to offer his/her readers something interesting and meaningful to think about? Why or why not?**

Yes, I learned how hard the military duty is in Korea and how it affect Hojun’s life. It is interesting for me.

1. **Overall, when you finished reading the essay, are you convinced? In other words, is the essay persuasive? Why or why not?**

Yes, almost, but it is better to expend his explanation of his experience to make his essay more convincing.

1. **How does the essay “flow”? Are there too many short sentences or too many long sentences? Does the writer use transition words (however, therefore, in addition, etc.)? Are there any major errors that disrupt reading? Be specific in your answer by explaining what the effect of sentences, transitions (or lack thereof), and/or errors have on the reader.**

It is good, when I am reading his essay, I can predict what he is going to say in the next paragraph. He use transition everywhere like “although” ”in spite of” BUT, there should be a transition between 2nd and 3rd paragraph, I can’t understand the relationship between them and what is he going to talk about by 3rd paragraph. He says he began to use walking instead of riding, how is it good for his life?